



HILLINGDON  
LONDON



## Executive Scrutiny Committee

**Date:** THURSDAY, 28 JULY 2011

**Time:** 7.30 PM OR AT THE RISING  
OF CABINET

**Venue:** COMMITTEE ROOM 7 -  
CIVIC CENTRE, HIGH  
STREET, UXBRIDGE UB8  
1UW

**Meeting  
Details:** Members of the Public and  
Press are welcome to attend  
this meeting

### Councillors on the Committee

Edward Lavery (Chairman)  
John Riley (Vice-Chairman)  
Mo Khursheed (Labour Lead)  
Brian Crowe  
Paul Harmsworth  
Brian Stead

### Representative Members for Education issues:

Vacancy – Church of England  
Diocesan Representative

Anthony Little – Roman Catholic  
Diocesan Representative

Vacancy – Parent Governor  
Representative

**This agenda and associated  
reports can be made available  
in other languages, in Braille,  
large print or on audio tape on  
request. Please contact us for  
further information.**

**Published:** Thursday 14 July 2011

**Contact:** Khalid Ahmed  
Tel: 01895 250843  
Fax: 01895 277373  
Email: [kahmed@hillington.gov.uk](mailto:kahmed@hillington.gov.uk)

This Agenda is available online at:

<http://modgov.hillingdon.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=236&Mid=1088&Ver=4>

Lloyd White  
Head of Democratic Services  
London Borough of Hillingdon,  
3E/05, Civic Centre, High Street, Uxbridge, UB8 1UW  
[www.hillingdon.gov.uk](http://www.hillingdon.gov.uk)



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# Useful information

Bus routes 427, U1, U3, U4 and U7 all stop at the Civic Centre. Uxbridge underground station, with the Piccadilly and Metropolitan lines, is a short walk away. Limited parking is available at the Civic Centre. For details on availability and how to book a parking space, please contact Democratic Services

Please enter from the Council's main reception where you will be directed to the Committee Room. An Induction Loop System is available for use in the various meeting rooms. Please contact us for further information.

Please switch off any mobile telephones and BlackBerries™ before the meeting. Any recording of the meeting is not allowed, either using electronic, mobile or visual devices.

If there is a FIRE in the building the alarm will sound continuously. If there is a BOMB ALERT the alarm sounds intermittently. Please make your way to the nearest FIRE EXIT.



# Executive Scrutiny

## About this Committee

This Committee exercises the right set out in the Policy Overview and Scrutiny Procedure Rules to **call-in and recommend for reconsideration any decisions made but not yet implemented** by the Cabinet, a Cabinet Member, a Council Committee or a delegated officer.

“Call in” enables the Committee:

- To question the circumstances of the decision
- To ask for more information about the decision if that contained in the report recommending the decision is considered inadequate
- To decide whether to ask for the decision to be reconsidered by the person or Committee that took it.

## Rules of Procedure

### Call-In

- (a) When a decision is made by the Cabinet, an individual Member of the Cabinet or a Committee of the Cabinet, or a Key Decision is made by an officer with delegated authority from the Cabinet, or under joint arrangements, the decision shall be published, including by electronic means, and shall be available at the Civic Centre normally within 2 working days of being made.
- (b) The notice of the decision will bear the date on which it is published and notified to all Members of the Council and will specify that the decision will come into force, and will then be implemented, on the expiry of 5 working days after the publication of the decision, unless the decision is called-in by the Executive Scrutiny Committee.
- (c) The Committee will normally meet immediately after the conclusion of a meeting of Cabinet to enable Members to review the decisions taken at the Cabinet meeting and give consideration to the potential for call-ins of items. Should there not be a consensus as to which decisions require such consideration then the matter will be determined by a majority vote of those Members of the Committee present and able to vote (with respect to the normal rules as set out in the Code of Conduct).
- (d) On areas where Members request further information or clarification, officers will be asked to provide a response to the Committee queries by midday on the following Monday following the Cabinet and this Committee meetings.
- (e). These responses will be sent to Members of this Committee by email, and based on this information, Members will be asked to email or telephone Democratic Services

on whether they are content with the information supplied or whether they recommend the calling –in of the particular item. The majority of the Committee Members will have to agree to the call-in request for it to proceed.

- (f). If an item is called in, another formal meeting of the Committee will take place on the Tuesday (or the Thursday at the latest) of the following week after Cabinet, where relevant officers and the relevant Cabinet Member, if appropriate, will be invited to discuss the called-in item.
- (g) Decisions made by an individual Member of the Cabinet or a Key Decision made by an officer with delegated authority from the Cabinet, can be called-in by agreement of the Chairman of the Committee and the lead representative of the majority party on the Committee within 5 working days of the decision being published. These Members shall inform the Head of Democratic Services of the reasons for the call-in. The Executive Scrutiny Committee will meet within 5 days of the Head of Democratic Services being notified to consider the decision.
- (h) If, having considered the decision, the Executive Scrutiny Committee are still concerned about it, then it may:
  - refer it back to the decision making person or body for reconsideration, setting out in writing the nature of its concerns, or
  - refer the matter to full Council, but only in the circumstances set out below.

A decision will not be referred to full Council unless either the Committee believes it to be contrary to the Policy Framework or Budget, or considers that it was a Key Decision that was not dealt with as such by the Cabinet. If it is referred to the decision maker they shall then reconsider within a further 5 working days, amending the decision or not, before adopting a final decision.

- (i) If following an objection to the decision, the Executive Scrutiny Committee does not hold the two meetings within 10 working days of the date of the Cabinet meeting, the original decision shall take effect at the end of the 10-day period.
- (j) If the matter was referred to full Council and the Council does not object to a decision which has been made, then no further action is necessary and the decision will be effective in accordance with the provision below.
- (k) If the Council does object, it has no authority to make decisions in respect of a Cabinet decision unless it is contrary to the policy framework, or contrary to or not wholly consistent with the budget. Unless that is the case, the Council will refer any decision to which it objects back to the decision making person or body, together with the Council's views on the decision. That decision making body or person shall choose whether to amend the decision or not before reaching a final decision and implementing it. Where the decision was taken by the Cabinet as a whole or a Committee of it, a meeting will be convened to reconsider within 10 working days of the Council request. Where the decision was made by an individual, the individual will reconsider within 10 working days of the Council request.

- (l) If the Council does not meet, or if it does but does not refer the decision back to the decision making body or person, the decision will become effective on the date of the Council meeting or expiry of the period in which the Council meeting should have been held, whichever is the earlier.

### **CALL-IN AND URGENCY**

The call-in procedure set out above shall not apply where the decision being taken by the Cabinet or executive member is urgent. A decision will be urgent if any delay likely to be caused by the call-in process would seriously prejudice the Council's or the public's interests or could lead to an (increased) risk of damage to people or property. The record of the decisions, and notice by which it is made public shall state whether in the opinion of the decision making person or body, the decision is an urgent one, and therefore not subject to call-in. The Head of Paid service or his/her nominee and the Chairman of the Executive Scrutiny Committee or his/her nominee must be informed that the decision will be implemented immediately upon their all agreeing that the decision is reasonable and to it being treated as a matter of urgency, or after 2 clear days should no objection to urgent implementation be received. Decisions taken as a matter of urgency must be reported to the next available meeting of Council, together with the reasons for urgency.

# Agenda

## **Chairman's Announcements**

- 1 Apologies for Absence and to report the presence of any substitute Members
- 2 Declarations of Interest in Matters coming before this meeting
- 3 To receive the Minutes of the meeting held on 16 June 2011 (**Pages 1-4**)

### **4 Exclusion of Press and Public**

To confirm that the items of business marked Part I will be considered in public and that the items marked Part II will be considered in private.

### **5 Consideration of Any Call-Ins (Pages 5-8)**

To hear the Call-In of any decision made at the Cabinet meeting prior to this meeting or made by Cabinet Members, other Council Committees or a delegated officer and published within five working days of this meeting.

Members should bring their Cabinet agenda to the meeting.

Members should consider any other decisions published in the five working days before this meeting.

The purpose of this meeting is to decide whether to refer back any decision to the decision maker.

# Agenda Item 3

## Minutes

Executive Scrutiny Committee

Thursday, 16 June 2011

Meeting held at Committee Room 7 - Civic Centre,  
High Street, Uxbridge UB8 1UW



HILLINGDON  
LONDON

	<p><b>Members Present:</b> Councillors John Riley (Vice-Chairman – In the Chair), Brian Crowe, Dominic Gilham, Paul Harmsworth, Mo Khursheed and Brian Stead.</p> <p><b>Representative Member for Education Issues:</b> Tony Little.</p> <p><b>Also Present:</b> Councillor Andrew Retter.</p> <p><b>Apologies:</b> Councillor Edward Lavery (Councillor Dominic Gilham substituting).</p> <p><b>Officer Present:</b> Khalid Ahmed (Democratic Services Manager).</p>
6.	<p><b>DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST</b></p> <p>Councillor Brian Crowe declared a Personnel Interest in Cabinet Agenda Item 7 – Older People’s Plan – Progress Update 2010-2011 as a member of his family was a user of Assistive Technology / Telecare. He remained in the room and took part in discussions on the item.</p>
7.	<p><b>MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 26 MAY 2011</b></p> <p>Agreed as an accurate record.</p> <p>[In relation to Minute No. 5 – Consideration of any Call-ins of Decisions Made at the Cabinet Meeting on 26 May 2011 – Cabinet Agenda Item 14 – Authority to Apply to Government for Consent for Change of Use from Green Belt Land, Members asked for further clarification on the officer response].</p>
8.	<p><b>EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC</b></p> <p>It was agreed that all items of business were considered in public.</p>
9.	<p><b>CONSIDERATION OF ANY CALL-INS OF DECISIONS MADE AT THE CABINET MEETING ON 16 JUNE 2011</b></p> <p>A general observation was made by Members that the Policy Overview Committees (POCs) had not had an opportunity to comment on a number of Cabinet reports because the Council’s meeting schedule meant that the Cabinet agenda was published after the POCs had met.</p> <p><b>Action By:</b></p>

**Action By:**

The Democratic Services Manager explained that Policy Overview Committees had the opportunity to request information on Cabinet items which were detailed on the Cabinet Forward Plan.

Members asked that their concerns on this be noted.

Members gave consideration to the Cabinet reports of 16 June 2011 and after careful consideration Members decided not to call-in any decision made by the Cabinet at their meeting.

However further information was requested on the following items:

**Cabinet Agenda Item 5 - Sustain, Renew and Prosper - Hillingdon' Approach to Regeneration 2011-2016**

Members asked:

(1) Why was consideration not given to pressing Transport for London (TfL) for an extension of the Metropolitan Line at Uxbridge to Heathrow?

(2) Why was consideration not given to lobbying the Mayor for London for his support for improving the north-south bus routes?

*[Subsequent to the meeting, officers provided the following response:*

*“(1) Hillingdon, along with other authorities in west London continues to engage pro-actively with TfL on a range of medium and longer-term aspirations to improve the various rail networks within the area, and whilst many options may have theoretical attractions and in particular travel and general commuting benefits for many of our residents, there also needs to be a recognition of the need for a firm business case which would support the considerable investment needed by TfL for many of these schemes, and the need to mitigate any adverse environmental impacts.*

*A rail link between Uxbridge and Heathrow is a positive aspiration, but given that it would go through residential areas it would involve large scale compulsory purchase and or significant tunnelling. This would require very high levels of investment, and funding to the level required is unlikely to be available for the foreseeable future. Given that the Government is presently committed to delivering Crossrail and HS2 over the next two decades it is unlikely that there would be Central government support for the initiative. In addition, the Mayor's Outer London Commission report dated June 2010 stated that*



	<p><i>taking account of the likely shortage of funding for new infrastructure available in the short-term, that there should be an emphasis placed on making the current system operate more effectively rather than on new big transport projects which are not feasible. The extension of the Metropolitan Line would be a major new project.</i></p> <p><i>The beauty of the Central Line extension from West Ruislip to Uxbridge is that the land already exists and therefore, it is a more realistic aspiration at this time. It would be comparatively easier in engineering terms and consequently cheaper financially and this is therefore why the Council is lobbying TfL. The extension is also supported by many of our Uxbridge town centre partners.</i></p> <p><i>(2) The Council has lobbied strongly in relation to improving north South links, including high-level meetings which have taken place between Cabinet Members and TfL Directors. The Council continues to work closely with TfL to improve public transport in the borough. Officers are continuing to lobby hard for better north-south links, but this is against the backdrop of limited investment by TfL in any new bus routes. More practical measures such as improved bus services from South Ruislip to Uxbridge are therefore being sought in the shorter term. The proposed extension of the Central Line would be a significant improvement in respect of improving North / South links. Additionally the Council has both submitted specific schemes and lobbied the Outer London Commission (which reports to the Mayor for London) in respect of improving North South bus links in particular.”</i></p> <p>Members also asked that in relation to <b>Cabinet Agenda Item 10 - Review of the Local List of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance and the Gazetteer of War Memorials</b>, on page 147 Appendix 2: New additions to Local List - 2011 officers amend the wards for Apollo Building (should read Botwell) and The Stables (should read Yiewsley).</p> <p><b>RESOLVED -</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. That the decisions made by Cabinet at their meeting on 16 June 2011 be endorsed and noted and no call-in be made of any decision.</li> <li>2. That officers be asked to provide responses to the issues outlined above.</li> </ol>	<p><b>Khalid Ahmed</b></p>
	<p><b>Meeting commenced at 7.30pm and closed at 7.55pm Next meeting: 28 July 2011 at 7.30pm or at the rising of Cabinet</b></p>	

These are the minutes of the above meeting. For more information on any of the resolutions please contact Khalid Ahmed on 01895 250833. Circulation of these minutes are to Councillors, Officers, the Press and Members of the Public.

# Agenda Item 5

**TO CONSIDER THE CALL IN OF ANY DECISIONS MADE AT CABINET ON 28 JULY 2011 OR MADE BY CABINET MEMBERS, OTHER COUNCIL COMMITTEES OR A DELEGATED OFFICER AND PUBLISHED WITHIN FIVE WORKING DAYS OF THE MEETING.**

Contact Officer: Khalid Ahmed  
Telephone: 01895 250833

## **REASON FOR REPORT**

To provide information to Committee Members on their powers to call in decisions made by Cabinet, Cabinet Members and officers with delegated power from Cabinet.

## **OPTIONS OPEN TO THE COMMITTEE**

To note the contents of this report and use it to inform the process of, considering whether to request further information on decisions taken at Cabinet, or to approve the Call-in of decisions. If Members agree to Call-In an item, another formal meeting of the Committee will take place on the Tuesday (or the Thursday at the latest) of the following week after Cabinet, where relevant officers and the relevant Cabinet Member, if appropriate, will be invited to discuss the called-in item.

To hear any called in decisions made recently by Cabinet Members, other Council Committees or a delegated officer.

The options open to the Committee when considering a Called In decision is to:

- i. Refer it back to the decision-making person or body for reconsideration, setting out in writing the nature of the Committee's concerns, or
- ii. Refer the matter to full Council, but only in the circumstances set out in the rules of procedure (included earlier in this agenda and reports), or
- iii. Decide not to refer back the decision. If the Committee wishes, it may give advice or feedback to the decision-maker and/or officers.

## **INFORMATION**

### **Criteria and process for deciding a call-in**

1. Advisory criteria agreed by the Committee for deciding whether or not to call in a decision are attached in Annex 1. If a decision is called in, the criteria will be referred to in the call-in notification, to give reasons for the Committee's decision.
2. The advisory criteria may be amended at any time, if the Committee feels they do not adequately reflect the range of reasons for calling in decisions.
3. At this Committee's meeting on 2 June 2009 approval was given to an amendment to the rules of procedure relating to Call-Ins. These amendments were approved by Council at their meeting on 2 July 2009.

4. The purpose of this meeting is to enable Members to review the decisions taken at the Cabinet meeting which is taking place prior to this meeting and give consideration to the potential for call-ins of items.
5. On areas where Members request further information or clarification, officers will be asked to provide a response to the Committee queries by midday on the following Monday (1 August 2011).
6. These responses will be sent to Members of this Committee by email, and based on this information, Members will be asked to email or telephone Democratic Services on whether they are content with the information supplied or whether they recommend the calling –in of the particular item. The majority of the Committee Members will have to agree to the call-in request for it to proceed. The Chairman will then advise the Head of Democratic Services.
7. If an item is called in, another formal meeting of the Committee will take place on the Tuesday (or the Thursday at the latest) of the following week after Cabinet, where relevant officers and the relevant Cabinet Member, if appropriate, will be invited to discuss the called-in item.
8. Any Member of the Committee may also propose a decision for call in by contacting Democratic Services, the Chairman of the Committee or the lead representative of the majority party on the Committee. It is recommended that this is done either before the Cabinet meeting or within 2 working days of the Cabinet meeting in order to allow time for the Committee to be consulted before the deadline for considering the decision expires. Any proposals will be notified to the whole Committee for comment and agreement.

### **Cabinet agendas and decisions**

9. All Members of this Committee are on the mailing lists to receive printed copies of the Cabinet meeting agendas and decisions.

### **Education decisions**

10. Representative Members for Education on the Committee can only vote on education issues. They may speak on education and other matters.

### **Cabinet Members' and officers' decisions**

11. The Forward Plan lists planned Cabinet Members' decisions and may be used to guide scrutiny of Cabinet Members' decisions. All Members of this Committee also receive an e-mail copy of all requests for Cabinet Members' decisions. All Councillors receive e-mail copies of Cabinet Members' decisions when made, which may be published at any time. Call-in on these decisions can only take place within 5 working days of the decision being published.
12. As advised at the Committee's first meeting, Government Guidance states that day-to-day decisions by officers should be excluded from scrutiny. There is no central record of officers' delegated decisions. Cabinet Members are briefed on the more significant delegated decisions at Directors' briefing. Directorates should keep records of delegated decisions.

## **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

Annex 1 – Criteria for call-in as agreed at the first meeting of the Committee in 2006.

Members should bring their copies of the Cabinet agenda and decisions and the Forward Plan to the meeting.

## **SUGGESTED SCRUTINY ACTIVITY**

- Refer to the attached criteria when considering Cabinet decisions for call-in, noting those that are mandatory and those that are advisory.
- To review the decisions taken at the Cabinet meeting which is taking place prior to this meeting and to give consideration to the potential for call-ins of items as outlined in the Call-In procedure.
- If a vote is taken, Education representatives may only vote on items or elements of item reports concerning education
- Consider recent Cabinet Member decisions – decide whether to call-in any of these.

## **Annex 1 – Criteria for call-in agreed at the Executive Scrutiny Committee’s first meeting**

### **Mandatory**

- a. A majority of the Committee agrees to call-in the decision (this is required by the Constitution)

### **Advisory**

- b. The expenditure or savings resulting from the decision are £25,000 or greater (to stop trivial call-ins)

and one or more of the following:

- c. The recommendations that lead to the decision do not adequately reflect the evidence contained in the report.
- d. There is evidence that does not appear to have been considered in reaching the decision.
- e. There is a high level of public interest or concern, perhaps evidenced by many complaints or a petition to Councillors.
- f. The decision appears to be contrary to an Auditor’s or an Inspector’s recommendation.
- g. Cabinet has not accepted a recommendation from another O&S committee.